

Implicit Bias, Part 2

PAFP Virtual CME Conference

November 13, 2020

Perry Meadows, MD, JD, MBA, FAAFP

Kento Sonoda, M.D.



Disclosure

- The speakers have nothing to disclose. There are no conflicts of interest with this presentation.

Learning Objectives

- Briefly explain the definition of implicit bias
- Understand general rules to addressing biases
- List 3 or more strategies to mitigate implicit bias

Pre-Test Questions

1. Implicit Biases are all but which of the following:
 - A. Pervasive
 - B. At an unconscious level
 - C. Always align with our explicit biases
 - D. Ageism is an example of an implicit bias

Pre-Test Questions

2. All the following are general rules for addressing bias except:
- A. Build empathy
 - B. Mindfulness
 - C. Collection of stereotypical information
 - D. Fairness and equality

Pre-Test Questions

3. Introspection is a technique used to address explicit biases
(True or False)

Visual Exercise

Who has Substance Use Disorder?

A



B









General Thoughts- Why Consider Bias

Why Are We Here?

- Appreciate the value and dignity of human life
- Understand and integrate patients' cultural, social, and religious customs and beliefs that may differ from their own
- Understand the individual, cultural, institutional, and societal biases that may affect ethical decision-making

- https://www.aafp.org/dam/AAFP/documents/medical_education_residency/program_directors/Reprint279_Ethics.pdf

Why Are We Here?

- The AAFP opposes all discrimination in any form, including but not limited to, that on the basis of actual or perceived race, color, religion, gender, sexual orientation, gender identity, ethnic affiliation, health, age, disability, economic status, body habitus, or national origin.
- Avoid voicing political opinions, stereotypes, jokes, or comments that could be perceived as offensive.
- Be respectful of all physician specialties and members of the care team.

-The EveryOne Project



Why Are We Here?

- Implicit Bias is a contributing factor to health disparities.
- Family physicians should make an effort to explore their own implicit biases to identify unconscious decisions and actions that may negatively affect the communities they serve.
- The AAFP recommends educating physicians about implicit bias and strategies to address it to support culturally appropriate, patient-centered care and reduce health disparities.

- The EveryOne Project



Bias

Explicit Bias v. Implicit Bias

- **Explicit bias** is attitudes that are at the conscious level, are deliberately formed and are easy to self-report.
- **Implicit bias** is attitudes that are at the unconscious level, are involuntarily formed and are typically unknown to us.
- It is possible and quite common for an explicit bias and an implicit bias to contradict each other. Prejudice is a frequently used example of this.

Addressing Implicit Biases- General Rules

General Rules to Addressing Biases

- **Explore your own potential for implicit bias:**
 - The [Implicit Association Test](https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/selectatest.html) measures how quickly you associate good or bad words with various topics.
(<https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/selectatest.html>)
- **Slow down when providing patient care:**
 - Shifting from “think fast” to “think slow”
 - Help you take deeper consideration of the patient in front of you
- **Ask for feedback from your employees and colleagues:**
 - Can help shed light on factors you may take for granted

<https://www.ama-assn.org/delivering-care/patient-support-advocacy/3-ways-battle-unconscious-bias>

General Rules to Addressing Biases

- Increasing self-awareness and taking the social perspective of others
- Building empathy
- Practicing mindfulness techniques
- Activating goals that promote fairness and equality
- Collecting counter-stereotypical information

- The EveryOne Project

General Rules to Addressing Biases

- Remember it is not just the words we use, but our attitude, voice tone, and inflection as well
- Body language is a powerful force in communication
- It is estimated the actual words we use convey 10% of the meaning, but the way we present the words is 90% of the meaning

Strategies to Mitigate Implicit Bias

Strategies to Mitigate Implicit Bias

- **Educate**
 - Introspection
 - Mindfulness
- **Expose**
 - Perspective-taking
 - Learn to slow down
 - Individuation
- **Approach**
 - Check your messaging
 - Institutionalize fairness
 - Take two

Strategies to Mitigate Implicit Bias- Educate

- Introspection
 - Explore and identify your own implicit biases
 - implicit association tests or through other means
(e.g. implicit.harvard.edu)

Strategies to Mitigate Implicit Bias- Educate

- Mindfulness
 - Practice ways to reduce stress and increase mindfulness
 - Reduce Negativity Bias
 - Reduce Self-positivity Bias
 - Helps see the full context of people's actions
 - Correspondence bias- ignore circumstances of the situation

Strategies to Mitigate Implicit Bias- Expose

- Perspective
 - Consider experiences from the point of view of the person being stereotyped.
 - Take the perspective of a first-person member of the group

Ex.) Consuming media about those experiences, such as books or videos, and directly interacting with people from that group

Strategies to Mitigate Implicit Bias- Expose

– Learn to slow down

- Pause and reflect on your potential biases before interacting with people of certain groups to reduce reflexive reactions.

Ex.) thinking about positive examples of that stereotyped group, such as celebrities or personal friends.

Strategies to Mitigate Implicit Bias- Expose

- Individuation

- Evaluate people based on their personal characteristics rather than those affiliated with their group.
- Prevent stereotyping by obtaining specific information about group members

Ex.) Connecting over shared interests or backgrounds

Strategies to Mitigate Implicit Bias- Approach

- Check your messaging
 - Embrace evidence-based statements
ex.) welcoming and embracing multiculturalism.
 - Stereotype replacement
 - Replace stereotypical responses with non-stereotypical
 - Counter Stereotypic imaging
 - Multicultural perspective
 - Group differences and memberships should not only be acknowledged and considered, but celebrated
 - Compared to color-blindness, which has been shown to increase negative attitudes

Strategies to Mitigate Implicit Bias- Approach

- Institutionalize fairness
 - Promote procedural change at the organizational level that moves toward a socially accountable system with the goal of equity
 - Deconstruct what is not working around equity
 - Reconstruct and support what is working
 - Shift the way decisions are made and consider the how and why
 - Heal and transform our structures, our environments, and ourselves

Strategies to Mitigate Implicit Bias- Approach

- Take Two
 - Practice cultural humility, a lifelong process of critical self-reflection to readdress the power imbalances of relationships
 - Cultural humility incorporates a lifelong commitment to self-evaluation and self-critique
 - Cultural humility is used to redress the power imbalances in relationship dynamics
 - Cultural humility allows the development of mutually beneficial and non-paternalistic partnerships with communities on behalf of both individuals and populations
 - Compare to cultural competence, which is the study of a finite body of knowledge with an endpoint in learning

Post-Test Questions

1. Implicit Biases are all but which of the following:
 - A. Pervasive
 - B. At an unconscious level
 - C. Always align with our explicit biases**
 - D. Ageism is an example of an implicit bias

Post-Test Questions

2. All the following are general rules for addressing bias except:
- A. Build empathy
 - B. Mindfulness
 - C. **Collection of stereotypical information**
 - D. Fairness and equality

Post-Test Questions

3. Introspection is a technique used to address explicit biases (True or False)

Questions?

References

- <https://www.aafp.org/family-physician/patient-care/the-everyone-project.html>
- implicit.harvard.edu
- How to Identify, Understand, and Unlearn Implicit Bias in Patient Care. Jennifer Edgoose, MD, MPH, Michelle Quiogue, MD, FAAFP, and Kartik Sidhar, MD. *Fam Pract Manag.* 2019 Jul-Aug;26(4):29-33.
<https://www.aafp.org/fpm/2019/0700/p29.html>
- https://www.aafp.org/journals/fpm/blogs/inpractice/entry/implicit_bias.html

For Additional Information

- <https://www.aafp.org/family-physician/patient-care/the-everyone-project.html>
- implicit.harvard.edu
- pmeadows@geisinger.edu or 570-271-8713

Thank you!

APPENDIX

Implicit Bias

- Implicit biases are **pervasive**. Everyone possesses them, even people with avowed commitments to impartiality such as judges.
- Implicit and explicit biases are **related but distinct mental constructs**. They are not mutually exclusive and may even reinforce each other.
- The implicit associations we hold **do not necessarily align with our declared beliefs** or even reflect stances we would explicitly endorse.

Implicit Bias

- We generally tend to hold implicit biases that **favor our own ingroup**, though research has shown that we can still hold implicit biases against our ingroup.
- Implicit biases are **malleable**. Our brains are incredibly complex, and the implicit associations that we have formed can be gradually unlearned through a variety of debiasing techniques.

Review of Types of Implicit Biases

Types of Implicit Bias- Affinity Bias

- Often called the Like-Likes-Like Bias
- People tend to gravitate towards or prefer those that are similar or share qualities like themselves.
- Common attributes that contribute to this bias include race, gender, age, or educational background
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Look for and learn about others that are of a different background from you, especially those of different racial or ethnic groups

Types of Implicit Bias- Ageism

- Discriminate against someone on the basis of their age
- Tends to affect women more than men
- Often occurs at a younger age in women than in men
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Remember that age is not always a measure of knowledge and skill levels. Don't let age be the judge of a person

Types of Implicit Bias- Anchoring

- Occurs when one relies upon the first piece of information received about an individual
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Don't make a judgment based upon the first thing you hear about someone. Get to know the whole person.

Types of Implicit Bias- Attribution Bias

- Attribute success to luck or help from others
- Attribute failures to lack of skill, lack of knowledge or personal shortcomings
- Tend to undervalue accomplishments and overvalue failures. This is often seen in association with gender bias. As an example, women are often given vague feedback based upon communication styles, while men are often given specific feedback based upon goals and skills that accelerate advancement
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Give credit where credit is due, both good and bad

Types of Implicit Bias- Beauty Bias

- Make assumptions based upon physical appearance about abilities and skills of the individual
- Tend to favor those that are more attractive
- Often associated with gender bias
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Judge people on their deeds and abilities, not their looks

Types of Implicit Bias- Confirmation Bias

- Look favorably on the information that confirms your beliefs that you already had developed.
- Focus on the information that supports your beliefs to the exclusion of other information
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Identify your own blind spots and become aware of your own implicit biases

Types of Implicit Bias- Conformity Bias

- Common in group settings
- Allow your views to be influenced by the views of others
- Similar to groupthink, which is “the practice of thinking or making decisions as a group in a way that discourages creativity or individual responsibility”. (<https://www.lexico.com/en/definition/groupthink>)
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Be your own person and develop your judgments independently of others

Types of Implicit Bias- The Contrast Effect

- Evaluate a person or situation by comparing them to another person or situation
- Often occurs when you have experienced the persons or situation very close in time to one another
- Requires you to ignore the individual merits or the person or situation
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Put your thought on paper and compare them independently of your own judgments or experiences

Types of Implicit Bias- Gender Bias

- Prefer one gender over another

or

- Assume one gender is better for a job than any other
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Use neutral language. Ask the person their preferred pronouns. Try to switch roles with the person and see if it changes your perspective on the situation

Types of Implicit Bias- Halo Effect

- Allow one positive fact about a person to be your focus, clouding one's judgement
- Place a person on a pedestal after learning something impressive about them
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Consider why you have a positive perspective of the person and examine whether it is related to another underlying bias

Types of Implicit Bias- Horns Effect

- Allow one negative fact about a person to cloud your judgment
- Perceive someone negatively after learning something unfavorable about them
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Consider why you have a negative perspective of the person and examine whether it is related to another underlying bias

Types of Implicit Bias– Name Bias

- Judge someone solely based upon their name
- We will often assume someone's background based upon their name
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Remove or block out the name and rely on the information available to you. Don't stereotype based upon a name

Types of Implicit Bias– Size Bias

- Judge a person based upon their weight or height
- **OPPORTUNITY:** Put yourself in the other person's place and consider how you would feel